



## Eastman Studies in Music

Ralph P. Locke, Senior Editor  
Eastman School of Music

Additional Titles of Interest

*The Art of Musical Phrasing in the Eighteenth Century:  
Punctuating the Classical "Period"*  
Stephanie D. Vial

*Bach and the Pedal Clavichord: An Organist's Guide*  
Joel Speerstra

*Bach's Changing World: Voices in the Community*  
Edited by Carol K. Baron

*Marianna Martines: A Woman Composer in the Vienna of Mozart and Haydn*  
Irving Godt  
Edited by John A. Rice

*The Music of Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach*  
David Schulenberg

*The Music of the Moravian Church in America*  
Edited by Nola Reed Knouse

*The Music of Wilhelm Friedemann Bach*  
David Schulenberg

*Ruth Crawford Seeger's Worlds:  
Innovation and Tradition in Twentieth-Century American Music*  
Edited by Ray Allen and Ellie M. Hisama

*Sacred Song and the Pennsylvania Dutch*  
Daniel Jay Grimmer

*Songs without Words:  
Keyboard Arrangements of Vocal Music in England, 1560–1760*  
Sandra Mangsen

A complete list of titles in the Eastman Studies in Music series may be found  
on the University of Rochester Press website, [www.urpress.com](http://www.urpress.com)


---

## Sara Levy's World

---

### Gender, Judaism, and the Bach Tradition in Enlightenment Berlin

Edited by Rebecca Cypess and Nancy Sinkoff

 UNIVERSITY OF ROCHESTER PRESS

Yi-heng Yang, and Steven Zohn. (The recording may be heard at [www.acisproductions.com/saralevyaudio](http://www.acisproductions.com/saralevyaudio).) Bringing the sounds of Sara Levy's salon to life in tandem with her intellectual and cultural context has been an illuminating and joyful experience, and we are grateful to these musicians for their contributions to this project.

The anonymous peer reviewers for the press provided extremely helpful comments and suggestions that have improved the book at every level, and we thank them for their time and intellectual generosity. Finally, we extend our heartfelt gratitude to our families for their constant encouragement and their limitless investment in our work.

Rebecca Cypess  
Highland Park, New Jersey

Nancy Sinkoff  
New York, New York

August, 2017

# Introduction

## Experiencing Sara Levy's World

Nancy Sinkoff

In the opening scene of Aaron Halle Wolfsohn's hilarious and biting satirical play *Laykhtzin und fremelay* (Yid./Ger., Silliness and Sanctimony, 1796), aesthetics and Jewish tradition are pitted against one another, with Jewish women the leading culprits in a headlong rush into excessive and ruinous modernization through music—both instrumental and vocal.<sup>1</sup> Wolfsohn (1756–1835) was a *maskil*, an enlightened Jew, and a member of the first generation of Prussian Jews to attempt to live as modern Europeans. In 1785, he arrived in Berlin, the capital of both the Prussian *Aufklärung* (Enlightenment) and the *Haskalah* (Heb., Jewish Enlightenment), an ideological movement dedicated to the modernization of Ashkenazic Jewish culture and society.<sup>2</sup> A gifted author in three languages, Wolfsohn soon became part of the circle around the renowned philosopher Moses Mendelssohn, and began to write for the Hebrew *Haskalah* journal, *Ha-me'asef* (The Gatherer), becoming its sole editor from 1794 to 1797. Dedicated to the early *Haskalah*'s moderate pathway of modernization, which sought to encourage Ashkenazic Jewry to shed what *maskilim* (Heb., plural of *maskil*) believed was obscurantist piety and reform it in the spirit of “reasonable” religion without succumbing to the blandishments of the pseudo-Enlightenment, Wolfsohn found himself—with other *maskilim*—in a state of despair toward the century's end.<sup>3</sup> The audience for their enlightened works beyond their own circle of Jewish intelligentsia was the sons and daughters of the Jewish bourgeoisie. Yet this group seemed to be headed solely toward becoming modern Germans, abandoning the world of their ancestors almost as quickly as they discarded the Yiddish vernacular for High German.<sup>4</sup> They—and especially their headstrong daughters—were the primary targets of his satire.<sup>5</sup>

The plot of *Laykhtzin und fremelay*, inspired by Moliere's *Tartuffe*, unfolds in the home of a Prussian Court Jew, Reb Henoch, a recent returnee to devout religious practice who has hired a certain Reb Yoysefkhe from Poland to tutor his son, Shmuel, in traditional Jewish subjects, such as the Talmud and biblical commentaries.<sup>6</sup> The Polish-Jewish tutor, however, is a sanctimonious and hypocritical charlatan who has designs on the hand of Reb Henoch's spoiled daughter, Yetkhen, whom he tries to woo—all the while chasing the household maid and being a regular client at a working-class brothel.<sup>7</sup> The other characters in the play are likewise flawed. Yetkhen herself is depicted as beautiful, intellectually and musically gifted, but superficial; her mother Teltse, as mildly hysterical and oblivious; and her gentile suitor, Herr von Schnapps, who kidnaps Yetkhen (a pun on his name) for ransom money, as criminal.<sup>8</sup> The play's only hero is Uncle Markus, the prototypical *maskil*: sage, calm, and reasonable.

Wolfssohn not only deployed ideological and linguistic markers to express his dismay at the wrongheaded approaches to modernity undertaken by both the rigidly pious and the licentious freethinking, but also directly addressed the ways in which the arts, especially music, functioned as part of the aspirational culture of modernizing elite Prussian Jews in the eighteenth century. In act 2, scene 4 of *Laykhtzin und fremelay*, Reb Yoysefkhe interrupts Yetkhen as she is playing on a keyboard instrument—likely a pianoforte or harpsichord—to declare his marital intentions. Although his bourgeois patron, Yetkhen's father, has approved the match, Yoysefkhe is soundly rebuffed by the imperious girl, who asserts her will—that distinctive feature of the Enlightenment self—to set him straight. The scene ends, presaging Yoysefkhe's failure, with his striking the piano in frustration. Yetkhen cries out, "Mein schönes Klavier ist ganz kaput" ("My beautiful piano is completely destroyed").<sup>9</sup>

Why did Wolfssohn focus on Yetkhen's engagement with music, in this scene highlighting her skill as a keyboardist and in earlier scenes emphasizing her vocal prowess?<sup>10</sup> Because music—its individual study and performance, its patronage through financial support of a composer's domicile as well as the commissioning of pieces, singing, and the hosting of private and semipublic concerts—formed an indispensable part of the lives of the Berlin Court Jews in the last quarter of the eighteenth century.<sup>11</sup> For enlightened eighteenth-century Europeans, music was an essential component of *Bildung*, the broad ideal of individual moral improvement, ethical cultivation, and aesthetic refinement that would foster a more capacious civic sphere.<sup>12</sup> Ardent proponents of *Bildung*, Jewish modernizers, the ideologically motivated *maskilim*, and the acculturating members of the social elite considered engagement with aesthetics and practice of the arts crucial to their negotiations with European culture. Both men and women were deeply engaged with the cultural, social, and linguistic transformations of Prussian Jewish society.

Gender mattered in these transformations. Elite Jewish men and women partook of European culture differently, and there was different symbolic value in the ways in which their participation was interpreted. Although the *maskilim* sought to transform "the Jews" generally, they focused their efforts on Jewish men. Prussian *maskilim* viewed traditional Jewish education, whose goal was to form *talmidei hakhamim*, male Torah scholars, not members of the *Gebildetebürgertum* (the educated and cultivated middle class), as an obstacle to *Bildung*, and waged a full-throated assault on traditional rabbinic pedagogy. They attacked it for its lack of standardized curriculum and trained teachers, its almost-exclusive focus on study of the Talmud, and its dependence upon Yiddish—a language considered a shameful "jargon" or bastardized dialect of German by modernizing Jews—as the oral conduit for sacred Hebrew scripture.<sup>13</sup> Prussian *maskilim* sought to transform young Jewish men into modern Jews capable of mastering mathematics, grammar, and geography, among other subjects vital to integration, and of learning Hebrew grammar to help revitalize Jewish society.<sup>14</sup>

Daughters were another matter entirely. In traditional homes, girls in Ashkenazic Jewish society learned religious essentials mimetically through their domestic relationships with their mothers, aunts, cousins, and sisters. *Maskilim* were slow to include Jewish daughters in their modern pedagogical efforts.<sup>15</sup> Yet the elite court Jewish families of Berlin supplemented their daughters' education, in order to rear them to be cultivated bourgeois housewives, with instruction in what can only be called the "gentile" arts: writing, speaking, and reading in German and French; dancing; singing; and studying, commissioning, enjoying, and performing music.<sup>16</sup> Keyboard lessons were a required part of the bourgeois training of such young women.<sup>17</sup>

Benefiting from royal patronage under Frederick the Great and bourgeois economic development, the arts and sciences grew among Berlin's cultural and intellectual elite, which included Huguenots, German Protestants, Catholics, and Jews. This dynamic cosmopolitan environment proved fateful for Jewish history. In contrast to the rest of Prussian Jewry, Berlin's wealthiest Jews enjoyed royal privileges after the Seven Years' War that allowed them to participate broadly in the stimulating environment of the capital.<sup>18</sup> Music played a pivotal role in the social gatherings—generally referred to as "salons"—created by German-Jewish women.<sup>19</sup> It was performed, listened to, and discussed by the *salonnières* and their guests, carefully chosen cultured individuals who could appreciate what was being played.<sup>20</sup>

Born in Berlin in 1761 just as the city was becoming a center of the Prussian Enlightenment, Sara Levy was among the select and highly visible cohort of Jewish women actively engaged in becoming modern Europeans and for whom music was a critical vehicle in that process.<sup>21</sup>

Empowered by his wealth and connections to the court as the principal supplier of the Prussian mint, her father, Daniel Itzig, was able to create a lifestyle for his family commensurate with that of elite gentiles of his period. Striving to integrate into non-Jewish society, Itzig adopted the mores, values, and social practices of the surrounding culture, building an extraordinary home, collecting art, becoming a patron of music, and insisting that his children, including his daughters, become proficient musicians.<sup>22</sup> He hired Johann Philipp Kirnberger, a student of Johann Sebastian Bach, to teach Hanna and Bella, the family's two eldest daughters. Sara's younger sister Fanny, later a prominent Viennese *salonnière* in her own right, was an instrumentalist who helped establish the *Gesellschaft der Musikfreunde*, and later created the music hall that became home to the Vienna Philharmonic Orchestra.<sup>23</sup> She and her husband Nathan von Arnstein hosted Mozart in their home in 1781, and entertained numerous other important composers and performers in Vienna.<sup>24</sup> Sara, who studied music with Wilhelm Friedemann Bach, was a gifted keyboardist, cited by both Jewish and non-Jewish writers for her skill. Levy played the harpsichord and the fortepiano, and owned instruments made by the famous Strasbourg craftsman Friedrich Silbermann.<sup>25</sup>

Sara played music at gatherings in her home and in the more public setting of the *Sing-Akademie zu Berlin*. She would become a patron of Friedemann Bach and, later, of his brother Carl Philipp Emanuel. Her patronage extended to numerous Jewish causes as well, including the Jewish orphanage in Berlin. She was also an avid collector, acquiring an enormous number of music manuscripts and printed editions by composers of her own day and from the previous generation.

Being a "young lady at music" did not necessarily mean playing solely for oneself.<sup>26</sup> Music making allowed elite women to blur the boundaries between the private, domestic female sphere and the public, male one. The eighteenth-century salon, though domestic, was not completely private; as Christoph Wolff notes, an orchestra of the size common in the eighteenth century could easily have fit into Levy's music rooms.<sup>27</sup> Levy often performed for an audience at home and—stretching the boundaries of expected female behavior—she also played for friends and acquaintances in the public venue of the *Sing-Akademie zu Berlin*, which had been founded in 1791 by Carl Fasch, a harpsichordist to the Prussian court.

Levy's relationship with the *Sing-Akademie* illustrates the central role that Jews played in the creation of German musical history and in laying the groundwork for Felix Mendelssohn's later initiation of a public Bach revival. After her husband Samuel Levy's death in 1806, Sara became particularly active in the *Sing-Akademie* and later donated her collection of music—which included instrumental pieces, solo works, chamber music, symphonies, and keyboard concertos, many by the Bach family—to the institution in the care

of Carl Friedrich Zelter, who had been appointed to the directorship of the *Sing-Akademie* in 1800. Zelter, in turn, became particularly committed to the works of J. S. Bach, performing excerpts from his Passions, Masses, and cantatas at a time when it was not common practice among the general public to revisit the music of the past century. Zelter would become the music teacher of Felix Mendelssohn in 1811, when Abraham and Lea Mendelssohn moved their family to Berlin from Hamburg, and would pass on his ardor for Bach to his remarkable student, ensuring continued interest in Bach's music. We may assume that some of Mendelssohn's zeal for the Bach tradition came from his maternal grandmother and great-aunts, including Sara Levy.<sup>28</sup>

In 1823, Abraham and Lea Mendelssohn formally converted to Protestantism, having baptized Felix and his siblings at birth, and added Bartholdy to their surname to distinguish themselves from their Jewish family. Sara Levy, along with her sister Fanny and some other members of the family, remained faithful to her origins. Sara and her husband had no children, and she left a large proportion of her considerable fortune to the Jewish orphanage mentioned above.<sup>29</sup> Natalie Naimark-Goldberg, in her contribution to the present volume, contends that Sara Levy's active participation in the Jewish community of Berlin was quite unusual within her circle, apparently reflecting a conscious decision to adhere to her family's religious traditions. She combined her participation in and dedication to German and European culture with her uninterrupted commitment to Jewish affairs in a way that other women, including some of her relatives and most of her friends, did not. Levy's deep engagement with music—even with a tradition dominated by Christian motifs—did not threaten her Jewishness.

Though Sara Levy's life intersected with the major social, ideological, political, and musical issues in the history of the European, German, and Jewish Enlightenments, she has been largely ignored. In the not-so-distant past, most scholars focused on the *salonnières* as examples of radical assimilation. The Jewish women of Berlin were seen as a litmus test of Jewish continuity in the face of rapid modernization. For Heinrich Graetz (1817–91) and Shimon Dubnow (1860–1941), master historians, respectively, of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries who wrote Jewish history as part of a spiritual and national commitment to modern Jewish existence, the *salonnières* were traitors who severed their ties to their religion and people.<sup>30</sup> In contrast to the traditionalist and nationalist views, pioneering feminist historians, seeking role models for independent women, praised the Jewish women of late-eighteenth-century Berlin as proto-feminists who successfully challenged the patriarchal conventions of traditional Jewish life.<sup>31</sup> Only recently has scholarship on the circle of modernizing Jewish women in Enlightenment Berlin shifted away from a preoccupation with those who chose to assimilate radically by converting to

Christianity. As we will see, Sara Levy stands out among other Berlin *salonnières* for her resolute commitment to Jewish life. Viewing her choices within a spectrum of complex, distinctive paths to modernization helps us to understand the entangled relationships among the Enlightenment, the *Haskalah*, acculturation, and secularization in the lives of late-eighteenth-century German Jews, both men and women.

Sara Levy's life also appertains to the field of music history generally and to German music history specifically. Examining her life allows scholars to probe how elite German Jews participated in the arts to construct and respond to late-eighteenth-century ideas, including philosophy and aesthetics, as part of their acculturation. The engagement with the arts among the Itzigs, Mendelssohns, Levys, von Arnsteins, and other late-eighteenth-century Jews played a decisive role in German culture, a role that has not always been recognized by musicologists and scholars of German musical history. Levy's passion for Bach and his legacy engages questions of musical historicism and its relationship to the processes of canonization of German and European art music in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. Levy's involvement with the *Sing-Akademie* and its archive illuminates the role Jews played in creating, protecting, and preserving the German musical heritage. The musical commitments of elite Jews in Sara Levy's circle also stand in dialogue with the male, textual Hebraist *Haskalah*. Indeed, as recent scholarship has emphasized, music played an important role in the modernizing ideology of the first *maskil*, Moses Mendelssohn, who viewed aesthetics as a key vehicle for uplifting his fellow Jews.<sup>32</sup>

Because Jews were central to the formation of the German middle class in the nineteenth century and music making was key to their aspirations, it behooves scholars to take more seriously the role of women like Sara Levy—and of the music she performed and patronized—in social class formation, as Marion Kaplan did in her pioneering study of the nineteenth century, *The Making of the Jewish Middle Class: Women, Family, and Identity in Imperial Germany*.<sup>33</sup> Fortunately, historians of Jewish modernity have begun to recognize how music making—as much as the acquisition of a literary European education—was a component of *Bildung*. Playing and listening to music could lead to refinement and the development of character. And obviously, Sara Levy's life is fertile ground for women's historians who seek to understand how gender informed Enlightenment ideals, the creation of a civic sphere, educational prescriptions, and every other aspect of German culture at the turn of the nineteenth century.<sup>34</sup>

Finally, reexamining the ways in which Jews in Sara Levy's world interacted with Christian musicians and music reopens the debate about the Prussian Enlightenment's tolerance of Jews. Decades ago, in his *Tradition and Crisis: Jewish Society at the End of the Middle Ages*—first published in Hebrew in 1958—Jacob Katz argued that eighteenth-century Berlin had successfully become a

“neutral society,” one that offered the possibility of full Jewish participation in and integration into German society.<sup>35</sup> He reevaluated this term in 1973, concluding that modern German nationalism, born in the late eighteenth century, had not been able to expunge the Christological bias against Judaism, even in the heady days of the sympathetic friendship and intellectual camaraderie between Moses Mendelssohn and Gottfried Ephraim Lessing.<sup>36</sup> In his revised view, Katz concluded that late-eighteenth-century Prussia had only created a “semi-neutral society.”<sup>37</sup>

Katz's reconsideration of the degree to which modernizing German Jews could be accepted into non-Jewish society at the end of the eighteenth century speaks to the vast issue of the historiographic reassessments of the Enlightenment that continue to this day.<sup>38</sup> Our volume grapples with the role of aesthetics in the Prussian Enlightenment in that reassessment, particularly with the legacy of negotiations of Jews and Christians over the “universality” of the music so beloved by both. Ruth HaCohen defined “the music libel against the Jews” as “the historical categorization of the Jew as a producer of noise in a Christian universe conceived of as dominated by harmonious sounds.” She observed that many of the key texts of the Prussian Enlightenment, including Bach's Passions and Handel's oratorios *Samson*, *Israel in Egypt*, and *Judas Maccabeus*, “exemplify and anticipate artistic articulations of ‘communal modes’ of sympathy, solidarity, and redemption in the centuries to come. [Yet], concomitantly, they also harbor latent modes of alienation and discrimination.”<sup>39</sup> The European Enlightenment unquestionably contained paradoxical, at times contradictory messages about Jews and their Europeanness; even the individuals who have come to be regarded as the most sympathetic to Jewish inclusion were skeptical of the success of Jewish integration.<sup>40</sup> This ambivalence played out musically, producing both harmony and dissonance.<sup>41</sup> Our volume does not shy away from that ambivalence.

On her own terms, Sara Levy was a fascinating and unusual person, whose legacy as a gifted musician allows us to experience her world and musical passions with all of our senses. She crossed cultural and intellectual boundaries of the early modern period, negotiating a variety of environments while maintaining her own religious identity. Levy did so while participating actively in and contributing to a broader cultural context in which secularization, modernization, and interfaith sociability, issues that are still relevant today, were central if contested subjects of discussion.

This volume is the result of an international symposium, “Sara Levy's World: Music, Gender, and Judaism in Enlightenment Berlin,” held at Rutgers University in September 2014. It seeks to explore anew the role of gender, music, aesthetics, modernity, anti-Judaism, and Jewish identity in Sara Levy's world. It strives to interpret the experience of the Jewish women of Berlin

through their own subjectivity and not through the lens of a maskilic parody or through either German or Jewish nationalist historiography, and to allow scholarship from a multidisciplinary perspective to enrich our understanding of the historical, musical, and philosophical contexts that shaped Sara Levy's role in German musical history—particularly in her family's commitment to preserving the legacy of the Bach family's corpus—and Jewish modernity. We have included articles by musicologists, intellectual and social historians, and scholars of modern Jewish thought and philosophy to create a polyphonic perspective on Sara Levy's world.

Our book is divided into three sections. Part 1, "Portrait of a Jewish Female Artist: Music, Identity, Image," treats Sara Levy the person, analyzing her place within the Jewish Enlightenment as well as her roles as patron, collector, keyboardist, and active participant in the preservation of the Bach musical legacy in late-eighteenth- and early-nineteenth-century Berlin. In some ways, this section could be considered "compensatory," ensuring that Sara Levy gets her rightful place in history and, in so doing, expanding the canvas on which German musical history has been written. Yet this is not a case of "add women and stir."<sup>42</sup> The neglect of Sara Levy's role has also distorted the significance of the Court Jewish phenomenon and extends to issues as broad as the relationship between aesthetics and social class formation, the role of Jews in cultivating musical historicism in late-eighteenth- and early-nineteenth-century Prussia, and the engagement of *maskilim* in what musicologist Ruth HaCohen has called the project of "sonic" integration.<sup>43</sup>

Chapter 1, Marjanne E. Goozé's "What Was the Berlin Jewish Salon around 1800?," looks carefully at the genesis, high point, and demise of the female-hosted salon in late-eighteenth-century Prussia. Despite the paucity of sources generated by the *salonnières* themselves, historians have nonetheless projected their own visions onto these women. Goozé emphasizes that the salons, which she considers liminal or extrasocial spaces, primarily allowed elite Jewish women to attain an education in German secular culture. Growing out of and functioning simultaneously with male-led reading circles, they featured discussions of books read privately as well as reading aloud, play acting, card playing, social interaction, and music. These intimate environments included Jews and Christians until the Napoleonic occupation of Berlin in 1806, which radically changed the political atmosphere that had encouraged the development of the salon.

In chapter 2, "Sara Levy's Musical Salon and Her Bach Collection," Christoph Wolff examines the history of Sara Levy's collection and the archive of the *Sing-Akademie zu Berlin*. It builds on the archival evidence uncovered in 2001 with the rediscovery of the collection of the *Sing-Akademie* in Kiev, and places the archive within the context of Sara Levy's musical and cultural worlds. The chapter also explores Levy's participation and lasting impact upon

the musical culture of the *Sing-Akademie* as an institution, with special reference to members of Levy's extended family who contributed to it—especially Felix Mendelssohn. The "Bach Cult" that Levy cultivated in the late eighteenth century reached its full expression in the Bach revival that Mendelssohn and his contemporaries initiated, beginning in the 1820s.

Chapter 3, Natalie Naimark-Goldberg's "Remaining within the Fold: The Cultural and Social World of Sara Levy," examines to what extent Sara Levy was an intrinsic part of the circle of elite female Jews in late-eighteenth-century Berlin whose embrace of modernization led to radical assimilation, including conversion. Naimark-Goldberg argues that Levy was a committed Jew who remained involved in Jewish causes and institutions, including her support of the *Haskalah* and Jewish education, throughout her life. This engagement was matched by her involvement in elite musical circles of her time. Naimark-Goldberg demonstrates that Levy combined her participation in and dedication to German and European culture with her continuous commitment to Jewish life.

In chapter 4, "Women's Voices in Bach's Musical World: Christiane Mariane von Ziegler and Faustina Bordoni," George B. Stauffer continues the examination of gender in eighteenth-century German musical history, illustrating that women played a crucial role in shaping the work of one of the most important composers of the preceding generation, Johann Sebastian Bach. His chapter focuses especially on the Leipzig poetess Christiane Mariane von Ziegler, who wrote texts for nine of Sebastian's cantatas, and on Faustina Bordoni, who appears to have sung the "Laudamus te" at the first performance of the *Missa* of the B-Minor Mass in Dresden in 1733. In their gender, if not their religion, these women foreshadow the significant role that Sara Levy would play in the transmission and reception of the venerable Bach's music.

Part 2, "Music, Aesthetics, and Philosophy: Jews and Christians in Sara Levy's World," treats the social and ideological implications of Sara Levy's world, specifically focusing on Christian-Jewish relations as they affected social interactions, musical commentary, religious polemic, and the role of Jews and Judaism in nineteenth-century German national culture, components of which became virulently anti-Jewish. These chapters explore anew the legacy of Lutheran anti-Judaism; the social meaning of conversion; the question of the "universality" of Christian music performed, commissioned, and preserved by Jews; and the personal negotiations of Sara Levy, who remained part of the Jewish community until her death, when many of those most dear to her had adopted Christianity.

Chapter 5, "Lessing and the Limits of Enlightenment," is reprinted from Martha B. Helfer's full study, *The Word Unheard: Legacies of Anti-Semitism in German Literature and Culture*, about latent anti-Semitism in the classical German literary canon.<sup>44</sup> This chapter reconsiders the literary legacy of the

great Enlightenment author Gotthold Ephraim Lessing (1729–81), Germany's most famous advocate of religious tolerance and an icon of interfaith friendship. Reexamining Lessing's three major works promoting tolerance toward Jews and Judaism—the theological treatise *The Education of the Human Race* (1780) and the two plays, *The Jews* (1749) and *Nathan the Wise* (1779)—Helfer finds a persistent tension running throughout this oeuvre, which helped to shape the rhetoric of anti-Semitism that subsequently informed German culture's views of Jews and Judaism.

Elias Sacks turns back to the “first” modern German Jew, the philosopher, intercessor, and biblical translator and commentator Moses Mendelssohn, to draw our attention to his important but little-studied translation of the Psalms and treatment of biblical music. In chapter 6, “Poetry, Music, and the Limits of Harmony: Mendelssohn's Aesthetic Critique of Christianity,” Sacks presents a Mendelssohn who deploys his aesthetic commitments not merely to defend Judaism, but also to critique Christianity. He shows that one of Mendelssohn's strategies for insisting on the suitability of extending civic rights to the Jews was to showcase the aesthetic richness of the Jewish tradition, especially through the sonority of biblical poetry. Even more subversively, Sacks claims that Mendelssohn also believed that fundamental theological and ethical problems plagued Christianity. Without a tradition of reciting the biblical text musically through a system of vocalized cantillation, Christians could not hear God's word and were thus deprived of the biblical text's essential meaning. Sacks's chapter complicates the view that Mendelssohn read the Psalms as a proof text for his belief in a common universalist ethos shared by enlightened Christians and Jews.

Chapter 7, Yael Sela's “Longing for the Sublime: Jewish Self-Consciousness and the *St. Matthew Passion* in Biedermeier Berlin” investigates the ways in which commitment to music and the aesthetic intimately shaped the lives—both internal and external—of the elite daughters of the Jewish bourgeoisie in late-eighteenth- and early-nineteenth-century Prussia. Sela explores how Rahel Levin Varnhagen (1771–1833), a Jewish woman in Sara Levy's circle, responded to the most dramatic musical event of her lifetime: the revival of Johann Sebastian Bach's *St. Matthew Passion* in 1829 at the *Sing-Akademie*, a venture initiated, organized, and conducted by Felix Mendelssohn Bartholdy, Levy's great-nephew. Sela claims that Varnhagen's engagement with the aesthetics of the sublime—as well as her understanding of the function of music and poetry in modern music—help to explicate the vexing issue of Jewish reception of the Lutheran ideology embedded in Bach's work among the members of Sara Levy's circle.

Part 3, “Studies in Sara Levy's Collection,” turns directly to the music collected and preserved by Sara Levy and her family, examining how music collecting can be interpreted as a social practice, one that gives insight into

identity formation and ideological commitment.<sup>45</sup> In chapter 8, “Duets in the Collection of Sara Levy and the Ideal of ‘Unity in Multiplicity,’” Rebecca Cypess turns to the collections of Sara Levy and her sisters Fanny von Arnstein and Tzipora Wulff (later Cäcilie von Eskeles), arguing that the sisters had a special interest in music for like instruments: duets for two flutes and two violas, and, especially, keyboard duos and double concertos that could be played on two harpsichords, two fortepianos, or a harpsichord and fortepiano together. Cypess's chapter explores the theoretical underpinnings of the duos in Sara Levy's collection through descriptions of performance and aesthetics by both Jewish and non-Jewish writers with whom Levy was likely familiar. She also adduces Moses Mendelssohn's writings to suggest that shared musical experiences could help to cultivate a sense of *Einheit in der Mannigfaltigkeit*—“unity in multiplicity.” Cypess claims that the musical duo may thus be understood as a metaphor for—and enactment of—an ideal of a social and religious sphere in which Jews and non-Jews could maintain their individual identities even as they built a common culture.

Chapter 9, Steven Zohn's “The Sociability of Salon Culture and Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach's Quartets,” also interprets musical compositions, in this case the three late quartets for flute, viola, and keyboard, Wq. 93–95, composed by Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach for the Berlin salon of Sara Levy, as a reflection of social practice. These pieces' unique scoring and progressive style set them apart from Bach's earlier chamber music. Building on Christoph Wolff's observation that the music displays “an evenly balanced instrumental discourse that permits the composer to engage in a lively, intense, and witty musical dialogue” and that it served as “a fitting interlude to the verbal conversations” at Levy's salon,<sup>46</sup> Zohn argues that it is precisely this conversational quality that marks Bach's quartets as exceptional within his oeuvre. In their alternating gestures of reciprocity, concession, and subversion, Bach's quartets represent a shift away from the aesthetic of inward self-expression, seen most clearly in his solo keyboard music, and toward an “outward” aesthetic emphasizing the type of human deportment and sociability characteristic of Levy's literary-musical gatherings.

Barbara Hahn's appendix, “The *Salonnière* and the Diplomat: Letters from Sara Levy to Karl Gustav von Brinckmann,” gives new documentary evidence of Sara Levy's interfaith sociability. Roughly twenty letters to and from Sara Levy, written between 1796 and 1819 in French and German, found in the archive of Swedish diplomat Karl Gustav von Brinckmann (1764–1847), attest to the active avenues for atypical friendships and interfaith sociability afforded by salon culture. Sara Levy met Brinckmann, the son of Secretary Hans Gustaf von Brinckmann and Countess Beata Kristina Leijon Manor, at the close of the eighteenth century, when his professional duties brought him to Berlin. He had received a strict Protestant religious education as a child. The letters



between Sara Levy and Brinckmann cover a broad range of shared cultural interests, including music and literature. Reproducing four complete letters, together with excerpts from others, in their original language and in English translation, the appendix allows readers to enter the intimate world of inter-faith friendship at the turn of the nineteenth century.

In addition to the text of these chapters, we are pleased to provide readers with access to a newly released recording of music for solo keyboard or for small chamber groups played, collected, commissioned, or underwritten by Sara Levy (The Raritan Players and Rebecca Cypess, *In Sara Levy's Salon*, Acis Productions B06ZYP8SRN). Readers may access this recording by going to the website [www.acisproductions.com/saralevyaudio](http://www.acisproductions.com/saralevyaudio) and entering the password shown in the front cover of this volume. The website includes ample program notes to supplement the multisensory experience of Sara Levy's World.

Immanuel Kant's iconic Enlightenment salvo, "Sapere aude!" (Dare to know!), charged his fellow Europeans to possess fully their own rationality and apply it to understanding and shaping the world. In her own time, Sara Levy did not hesitate to know herself and the world around her. This volume is our effort to explore all the facets of Sara Levy's complex world. In so doing, we also hope to give Sara Levy her historical due, honoring her selfhood as a woman, a musician, a Jew, and an enlightened person.

## Notes

1. Wolfssohn wrote the play in a mixture of Judeo-German and Yiddish—with both languages using Hebrew orthography—which allowed the playwright to tailor his characters' speech to their cultural and social positions. A Hebrew version was published the same year. On the play, see Joel Berkowitz and Jeremy Dauber, ed. and trans., *Landmark Yiddish Plays: A Critical Anthology* (Albany: SUNY Press, 2006), 10–18, and Shmuel Feiner, *The Origins of Jewish Secularization in Eighteenth-Century Europe*, trans. Chaya Naor (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2010), 219–20. On Wolfssohn, see Jutta Strauss, "Aaron Halle-Wolfson: Ein Leben in drei Sprachen," in *Musik und Ästhetik in Berlin Moses Mendelssohns*, ed. Anselm Gerhard (Tübingen: Max Neimeyer Verlag, 1999), 57–76. See 72n86 on his characters' languages.
2. The literature on the *Haskalah* in Prussia is vast. See, for example, Steven M. Lowenstein, *The Berlin Jewish Community: Enlightenment, Family, and Crisis, 1770–1830* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1994); Shmuel Feiner, *The Jewish Enlightenment*, trans. Chaya Naor (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004); Michael A. Meyer, *The Origins of the Modern Jew: Jewish Identity and European Culture in Germany 1749–1824* (Detroit, MI: Wayne State University Press, 1979); Nancy Sinkoff, "Haskalah," in *Europe 1450 to 1789: Encyclopedia of the Early Modern World*, ed. Jonathan Dewald (New York: Charles Scribner's

- Sons, 2004), 3:141–43; David Sorkin, *The Transformation of German Jewry, 1780–1840* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1987); Shmuel Feiner and David Sorkin, ed., *New Perspectives on the Haskalah* (Oxford: Littman Library of Jewish Civilization, 2001).
3. For an interpretation of the moderate ethos of the Jewish Enlightenment, see David Sorkin, *Moses Mendelssohn and the Religious Enlightenment* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1996); on the phenomenon of the *falsche Aufklärung* in its various national forms, see Shmuel Feiner, "The Pseudo-Enlightenment and the Question of Jewish Modernization," *Jewish Social Studies* (new series) 3, no. 1 (1996): 62–86.
4. Language—especially the relationship among Yiddish, ancient Hebrew-Aramaic, modernizing Hebrew, and German—played a crucial role in the symbolic world of the Jewish Enlightenment and in the practical world of acculturating Prussian Jews. Wolfssohn's play, as well as a similar parody penned by the *maskil* Isaac Euchel, *Reb Henokh, oder vos tut men damit?* (Reb Henokh, or What's to Be Done with It?), made use of all of these languages. As Berkowitz and Dauber have noted, both Wolfssohn and Euchel placed their characters along a linguistic spectrum that was simultaneously an ideological one. See Berkowitz and Dauber, "Introduction," in *Landmark Yiddish Plays*, 1–23; Isaac Euchel, *Reb Henoch, oder: Woß tut me damit: Eine jüdische Komödie der Aufklärungszeit*, in *Jidische shtudies* 11, ed. Marion Aptroot and Roland Gruschka (Hamburg: H. Buske, 2004). On the language polemics in the *Haskalah*, see Shmuel Werses, "Inter-Lingual Tensions in the Maskilic Periodical 'Hame'asef and Its Time in Germany," *Dappim: Research in Literature* 11 (1997–98): 29–69; Dan Miron, *A Traveler Disguised: A Study in the Rise of Modern Yiddish Fiction in the Nineteenth Century* (New York: Schocken Books, 1973); Nancy Sinkoff, *Out of the Shtetl: Making Jews Modern in the Polish Borderlands*. Brown Judaic Studies 336 (Providence, RI: Brown University Press, 2004), ch. 4; and John M. Efron, *German Jewry and the Allure of the Sephardic* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2016), ch. 1.
5. On Jewish women in late-eighteenth-century Berlin, see Deborah Hertz, *Jewish High Society in Old Regime Berlin* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1988); Deborah Hertz, *How Jews Became Germans: The History of Conversion and Assimilation in Berlin* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2007); Natalie Naimark-Goldberg, *Jewish Women in Enlightenment Berlin* (Oxford: Littman Library of Jewish Civilization, 2013); and Lowenstein, *The Berlin Jewish Community*.
6. On the Court Jews, see Steven M. Lowenstein, "Court Jews, Tradition and Modernity," in *Hoffjuden: Ökonomie und Interkulturalität die jüdische Wirtshaftsélite im 18. Jahrhundert*, ed. Rotraud Ries and J. Friedrich Battenberg (Hamburg: Christians Verlag, 2002), 369–81.
7. The plausibility of Wolfssohn's characterization of Reb Yoysefkhe's lasciviousness is echoed in Henriette Herz's memoirs: "My teacher in this as well as in other subjects was one of the most immoral men that my mother could have selected—my good mother believed she had chosen well, and only later did I come to realize how bad her choice had been." Henriette Herz, "Memoirs of



- a Jewish Girlhood," in *Bitter Healing: German Women Writers from 1700 to 1830: An Anthology*, ed. Jeannine Blackwell and Susanne Zantop, trans. Marjanne E. Goozé with Jeannine Blackwell (Lincoln, NE: University of Nebraska Press, 1990), 306.
8. On Schnapps's name, see Berkowitz and Dauber, *Landmark Yiddish Plays*, 93n33.
  9. Aaron Halle Wolfssohn, "Leichtsinn und Frömmerei: Ein Familien Gemälde in Drei Aufzügen," in *Lustspiele zur Unterhaltung beim Purim-Feste* (Breslau: s.n. 1796), 1:33–111. In *Landmark Yiddish Plays*, 97, Berkowitz and Dauber leave the phrase untranslated. I have translated *Klavier* as "piano," but this term would have to include a variety of keyboard instruments, including fortepianos and harpsichords, in use in the eighteenth century. Further discussion of keyboard terminology may be found in Rebecca Cypess's contribution to this volume.
  10. Reb Henokh: "(Mocking her) . . . 'I'd be willing to bet you that the Rebbe isn't so happy with her! What does she do all day long? Does she say blessings? Does she pray? Does she open a Yiddish Bible or a prayer book? All you hear around her, all day long, is singing and music, music and singing, enough to drive a person crazy. And when the beloved Sabbath finally comes around, you wouldn't remember it's holy. God forbid! This is the sin that I'm getting more and more concerned about.'" (Emphasis is mine). Berkowitz and Dauber, *Landmark Yiddish Plays*, 84; see, too, pp. 90 and 94.
  11. Alexander Altmann, *Moses Mendelssohn: A Biographical Study* (Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama Press, 1973); Feiner, *The Origins of Jewish Secularization*; Lowenstein, *The Berlin Jewish Community*; and Ruth HaCohen, *The Music Libel Against the Jews* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2011), 5.
  12. David Sorkin, "Wilhelm von Humboldt: The Theory and Practice of Self-Formation (Bildung), 1791–1810," *Journal of the History of Ideas* 44 (1983): 55–73.
  13. The language polemics of this period also took on a gendered edge, with Yiddish portrayed as a language "for women or for men who are like women" and Hebrew and High German identified with men. See Naomi Seidman, *A Marriage Made in Heaven: The Sexual Politics of Hebrew and Yiddish* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997). Yet acculturating German Jewish women also considered Yiddish shameful and unaesthetic. Rahel Levin—later Varnhagen—referred to Yiddish as "howling" in a letter to her siblings penned in 1794. See Barbara Hahn, *The Jewess Pallas Athena: This Too a Theory of Modernity*, trans. James McFarland (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2005), 28.
  14. The key text calling for the revitalization of Ashkenazic education by redirecting its emphasis away from the Talmud and including secular subjects is Naftali Herz Wessely, *Divrei Shalom Ve'emet* (Berlin: Hevrat Hinuch Ne'arim, 1782). *Maskilim* in Berlin created the first modern Jewish school, the *Jüdische Freischule* (1778). A *Haskalah* press called "Society for the Education of the Youth" (1784) published the first modern textbook for children, the *Lesebuch für jüdische Kinder* (1779) and the Hebrew journal mentioned above. Simha Assaf, *Mekorot Le-toldot Ha-Hinukh Be-yisra'el* (Tel Aviv: Devir, 1954) and Zohar Shavit, "From Friedländer's Lesebuch to the Jewish Campe—The Beginning of Hebrew Children's Literature in Germany," *LBIYA* 33 (1988): 385–415. In Russian lands, Isaac Baer Levinsohn picked up the baton to transform Jewish education in *Te'udah Be-Yisra'el: Kolel Gidrei ha-Torah veha-hokhmah* (Vilna-Horodno: Menachem Man and Simcha Zimel Publishers, 1828).
  15. Only boys studied at the *Jüdische Freischule* in its early years. After some thirty years, in 1812, the *maskil* Joseph Perl's modern Jewish school opened in Tarnopol, Austrian Galicia, with a class of sixteen, of whom five were girls. The girls were expected to study German, Russian, religion, ethics, reading and writing Yiddish, and the "important principles of the skill of homemaking," including agriculture, accounting, and other domestic topics. See Philip Friedman, "Joseph Perl as an Educational Activist and His School in Tarnopol," *YIVO bleter* 31–32 (1948): 148.
  16. It would take another half century and an eastward geographic shift for the emergence of *maskilot*, ideologically self-conscious modernizing Jewish women literate in Hebrew and familiar with traditional Jewish texts. See Carole Balin, *"To Reveal Our Hearts": Jewish Women Writers in Tsarist Russia* (Cincinnati, OH: Hebrew Union College Press, 2000); and Iris Parush, *Reading Jewish Women: Marginality and Modernization in Nineteenth-Century Eastern European Jewish Society*, trans. Saadya Sternberg. Brandeis Series on Jewish Women, Tauber Institute for the Study of European Jewry series (Hanover, NH: University Press of New England, 2004).
  17. Ezra Mendelsohn, "On the Jewish Presence in Nineteenth-Century European Musical Life," *Studies in Contemporary Jewry, An Annual: Modern Jews and Their Musical Agendas*, 9 (1993): 3–16.
  18. Lowenstein, *The Berlin Jewish Community*, 30–32.
  19. As Barbara Hahn has noted, the term "salon" was not used until the 1840s, and generally referred to exclusive, highly formal, high-society gatherings. Yet visitors to the Itzig and Levy homes could hear music in a variety of settings ranging from small, intimate gatherings to larger, formal performances. See Hahn, *The Jewess Pallas Athena*, 42–55 and Rebecca Cypess, "Ancient Poetry, Modern Music, and the *Wechselgesang der Mirjam und Debora*: The Meanings of Song in the Itzig Circle," *Bach: Journal of the Riemenschneider Bach Institute* 47, no. 1 (2016): 63.
  20. Although the word "*salonnière*"—like the term "*salon*"—is problematic, we have chosen to retain it throughout the volume because it is so widespread in the literature on elite Jewish women in late-eighteenth-century Prussia and because there is no suitable alternative. The word "hostess," while arguably more accurate, connotes a quality of passive domesticity that does not reflect the agency of the women in Sara Levy's circle.
  21. On Sara Levy's biography, see Thekla Keuck, *Hoffruden und Kulturbürger: Die Geschichte der Familie Itzig in Berlin* (Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2011).
  22. David Conway, *Jewry in Music: Entry to the Profession from the Enlightenment to Richard Wagner* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012), ch. 3, particularly pp. 144–48 and 171.

23. Throughout this volume, authors refer to Sara Levy as "Sara Itzig," "Sara Levy," "Madame Levy," and "Sara." Although the use of a first name for a woman could be construed pejoratively, this is certainly not the case in this book. Readers will also note that the physician Markus Herz is referred to as "Markus" and not by his surname in certain passages. The choice to use a fore-name or a surname was simply stylistic.
24. Hilde Spiel, *Fanny von Arnstein: A Daughter of the Enlightenment, 1758–1818*, trans. Christine Shuttleworth (New York: Berg, 1991). On Mozart's relationship to Sara Levy and Fanny von Arnstein, see Christoph Wolff, *Mozart at the Gateway to His Fortune: Serving the Emperor, 1788–1791* (New York: W. W. Norton, 2012), 57–63.
25. Christoph Wolff, "The Bach Tradition among the Mendelssohn Ancestry," in *Mendelssohn, the Organ, and the Music of the Past: Constructing Historical Legacies*, ed. Jürgen Thym (Rochester, NY: University of Rochester Press, 2014), 213–23. See also Peter Wollny, "Ein förmlicher Sebastian und Philipp Emanuel Bach Kultus": *Sara Levy und ihr musikalisches Wirken, mit einer Dokumentensammlung zur musikalischen Familiengeschichte der Vorfahren von Felix Mendelssohn Bartholdy* (Wiesbaden: Breitkopf & Härtel, 2010); Peter Wollny, "Sara Levy and the Making of Musical Taste in Berlin," *Musical Quarterly* 77, no. 4 (1993): 651–88; Christoph Wolff, "A Bach Cult in Late-Eighteenth-Century Berlin: Sara Levy's Musical Salon," *Bulletin of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences* 58, no. 3 (2005): 26–39. On Levy's circle and the *Sing-Akademie*, see Celia Applegate, *Bach in Berlin: Nation and Culture in Mendelssohn's Revival of the St. Matthew Passion* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2005), ch. 4, "Musical Amateurism and the Exercise of Taste."
26. The phrase "young lady at music" is borrowed from Matthew Head, "'If the Pretty Little Hand Won't Stretch': Music for the Fair Sex in Eighteenth-Century Germany," *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 52, no. 2 (1999): 203–54.
27. See Wolff's contribution to this volume.
28. Wolff, "A Bach Cult." For a brief history of the establishment of the *Sing-Akademie*'s archive, its disappearance after World War II, and its restitution after the end of the Cold War, see Christoph Wolff, "Recovered in Kiev: Bach et al. A Preliminary Report on the Music Collection of the Berlin Sing-Akademie," *Notes*, 2nd series, 58, no. 2 (2001): 259–71; and Joachim Jaenecke, "Das Archiv der Sing-Akademie zu Berlin," *Fontes Artis Musicae* 51, no. 3–4 (2004): 373–78. The introductory essays in the catalogue of the *Sing-Akademie* provide overviews of its holdings and history; see Axel Fischer and Matthias Kornemann, eds., *The Archive of the Sing-Akademie zu Berlin: Catalogue / Das Archiv der Sing-Akademie zu Berlin: Katalog* (Berlin: de Gruyter, 2010).
29. Levy's last will and testament is reproduced in Wollny, "Ein förmlicher Sebastian und Philipp Emanuel Bach Kultus," 57–60.
30. Heinrich Graetz, *History of the Jews*, vol. 5, trans. Bella Löwy (Philadelphia, PA: The Jewish Publication Society of America, 1891–98), 413, and Shimon Dubnow, *History of the Jews* vol. 4, trans. Moshe Spiegel (South Brunswick, NJ: T. Yoseloff, 1971), 641–43.

31. Hertz, *Jewish High Society in Old Regime Berlin*, 13. Naimark-Goldberg also argues that the Berlin women adopted "early feminist positions on the role of women and society." See Naimark-Goldberg, *Jewish Women in Enlightenment Berlin*, 1; on her use of the term "feminist," see 7n17.
32. Jonathan Karp, "The Aesthetic Difference: Moses Mendelssohn's *Kohélet Musar* and the Inception of the Berlin Haskalah," in *Renewing the Past, Reconfiguring Jewish Culture: From al-Andalus to the Haskalah*, ed. Ross Brann and Adam Sutcliffe (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2003), 93–120. The German-language *Haskalah* journal *Sulamith* published sheet music from 1810 forward. Efron, *German Jewry and the Allure of the Sephardic*, 35–37, and 248n59.
33. Marion Kaplan, *The Making of the Jewish Middle Class: Women, Family, and Identity in Imperial Germany* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1991).
34. For a study of French women's participation in the Enlightenment and the revolutionary impact of print culture on their self-creation as modern Europeans, see Carla Hesse, *The Other Enlightenment: How French Women Became Modern* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2001).
35. Jacob Katz, *Masoret u-Mashber: Ha-Hevrah Ha-yehudit Be-motsa'ei Yemei Ha-benayim* (Jerusalem: Mossad Bialik, 1957–58) and Jacob Katz, *Tradition and Crisis: Jewish Society at the End of the Middle Ages*, trans. Bernard Dov Cooperman (New York: New York University Press, 1993), chapter 23, "The Emergence of the Neutral Society," 213–25.
36. Altmann, *Moses Mendelssohn*, 27, 36–50. See, too, Klaus L. Berghahn, "On Friendship: The Beginnings of a Christian-Jewish Dialogue in the 18th Century," in *The German-Jewish Dialogue Reconsidered: A Symposium in Honor of George L. Mosse*, ed. Klaus L. Berghahn (New York: Peter Lang, 1996), 5–23; Peter Svare Valeur, "Notes on Friendship: Moses Mendelssohn and Gotthold Ephraim Lessing," *Oxford German Studies* 45, no. 2 (2016): 142–56; and Martha Helfer's contribution to this volume.
37. Jacob Katz, *Out of the Ghetto: The Social Background of Jewish Emancipation, 1770–1870* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1973), 54. David Sorkin expanded upon the idea that acculturating German Jews created a Jewish subculture in the nineteenth century that functioned distinctly from general German culture and, in his words, "remained invisible to its members." Sorkin, *The Transformation of German Jewry*, 3–9.
38. Annelien De Dijn, "The Politics of Enlightenment: From Peter Gay to Jonathan Israel," *Historical Journal* 55 (2012): 785–805.
39. HaCohen, *The Music Libel Against the Jews*, 80–81.
40. For the French case outlining skepticism—and even hostility—to Jewish integration, see the classic work by Arthur Hertzberg, *The French Enlightenment and the Jews* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1968). See, too, Adam Sutcliffe, "Can a Jew Be a Philosophe? Isaac de Pinto, Voltaire, and Jewish Participation in the European Enlightenment," *Jewish Social Studies* (new series) 6, no. 3 (2000): 31–51.
41. For a recent exposition of Bach's Lutheran anti-Judaism, see Michael Marissen, *Bach & God* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2016). The novel *And After the Fire* places Sara Levy's fictional inheritance of an anti-Jewish cantata scored by

Bach at the center of its drama. Lauren Belfer, *And After the Fire* (New York: Harper Collins, 2016).

42. By asking questions about women and gender, historians have challenged and transformed whole historical narratives. Commented the American and feminist historian Linda Gordon regarding this revolution in historiography, writing women's history "does not simply add women to the picture we already have of the past, like painting additional figures into the spaces of an already completed canvas. It requires repainting the earlier pictures, because some of what was previously on the canvas was inaccurate and more of it was misleading." Linda Gordon, *U.S. Women's History* (Washington: American Historical Association, 2nd edition, 1997), 2. See, too, the discussion of gender—rather than women—as a category of historical analysis in Joan Wallach Scott, *Gender and the Politics of History* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1988). On the particular challenge of writing premodern Ashkenazic Jewish women's history, in which the over-arching binary and hierarchical framework of the traditional religious context defined gender relations, see Moshe Rosman, "The History of Jewish Women in Early Modern Poland: An Assessment," in *Polin: Studies in Polish-Jewry* 18: Jewish Women in Eastern Europe, ed. ChaeRan Freeze, Paula Hyman, and Antony Polonsky (Oxford: Littman Library of Jewish Civilization, 2005), 25–56.
43. HaCohen, *The Music Libel Against the Jews*, 80.
44. Martha B. Helfer, *The Word Unheard: Legacies of Anti-Semitism in German Literature and Culture* (Evanston, IL: Northwestern University Press, 2011).
45. Aspects of music collecting in the age of Sara Levy are discussed in Matthias Kornemann, "Zelter's Archive: Portrait of a Collector," in *The Archive of the Sing-Akademie zu Berlin*, 19–25; and in Annette Richards, "Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach, Portraits, and the Physiognomy of Music History," *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 66, no. 2 (2013): 337–96.
46. Wolff, "A Bach Cult," 30.