

based on their musical traditions. For example, he describes the music of “heathens” thus: “For just as they had no true knowledge of God in that they did not recognize the Trinity in God, they also could not recognize the harmonic triad, for they did not consider the third to be a consonance, even though harmony without the addition of the third is quite deficient and incomplete, yea, even lifeless” (p. 83).

Finally, Werckmeister wishes to confirm the subordinate position of linear staff notation in relation to its superior counterpart, German organ tablature. He spends several chapters denigrating the linear staff system, pointing to the inconvenience of having to read all the different clefs and the confusing process of adding sharps and flats to pitches, which to him suggests unnecessary chromatic semitones. The new and practical equal temperament tuning is central to Werckmeister’s argument here. While he was not always a fan of equal temperament and admits as much in his treatise, he boldly announces his change of heart, asserting the basic quality of the tuning in the title for chapter 11: “Proof of how everything can be played or sung through the twelve note-names.” In essence, he argues that if there are truly only twelve note names to know, linear staff notation introduces unnecessary confusion.

Bartel’s English translation of Werckmeister’s German is both coherent and idiomatic and makes an important document from the German baroque available to a much wider audience. The power of this volume, however, rests in the ancillary materials, which also increase the accessibility of the eighteenth-century document. The lengthy preface introduces key concepts necessary for understanding the many subtleties in Werckmeister’s treatise. Moreover, the detailed footnotes in Bartel’s overview of the treatise’s content explain Werckmeister’s nuanced

baroque language and references without cluttering the text of the translation itself.

KIMBERLY BECK HIEB
West Texas A&M University

Sara Levy’s World: Gender, Judaism, and the Bach Tradition in Enlightenment Berlin. Edited by Rebecca Cypess and Nancy Sinkoff. (Eastman Studies in Music.) Rochester, NY: University of Rochester Press, 2018. [x, 292 p. ISBN 9781580469210 (hardcover), \$99.00.] Illustrations, music examples, appendices, bibliography, index, online audio files.

This well-written, insightful, interdisciplinary, and excellent work is an effort to explore the facets of Sara Levy’s complex world and in so doing bring that remarkable woman from the margins of intellectual and cultural history. It places Sara Levy (1761–1854) center stage and gives her the historical due that she deserves by honoring this very talented musician, committed Jew, and “enlightened person” (p. 12). The book stems from an international conference at Rutgers University in 2014 that explored anew the roles of gender, music, aesthetics, modernity, and anti-Judaism in Levy’s accomplishments. The multidisciplinary conference involved scholars of intellectual-social-cultural history, Jewish studies, musicology, and philosophy to create a “polyphonic perspective” (p. 8).

The German Jewish women who hosted salons not only were patrons but, as in the case of Levy, were also intellectuals for whom music was a critical vehicle for becoming modern Europeans. Levy helped form German musical history by promoting the revival of baroque music, particularly the appreciation of Johann Sebastian Bach. Fanny, Sara’s younger sister, became a prominent Viennese *salonnière* who estab-

lished the Gesellschaft der Musikfreunde and the music hall that became the home of the Vienna Philharmonic Orchestra. She hosted Mozart at her home in 1781. Sara, who studied music with Wilhelm Friedemann Bach and was a patron of his brother Carl Philipp Emanuel, was a gifted keyboardist who performed at both her home and the Sing-Akademie zu Berlin. Levy influenced the zeal of her grandnephew, Felix Mendelssohn, for the Bach tradition, although unlike Mendelssohn, Levy remained a committed and devoted Jew. For example, Levy was a great philanthropist of many Jewish causes who willed her considerable fortune to the Jewish orphanage in Berlin. According to these essays, her “deep engagement with music—even with a tradition dominated by Christian motifs—did not threaten her Jewishness” (p. 5). This conclusion contradicts the views of historians Heinrich Graetz (1817–1891) and Shimon Dubnov (1860–1941), who viewed the *salonnières* as “traitors who severed their ties” with the Jewish community. On the other hand, feminists and scholars of gender studies see role models in these extraordinary independent women of high culture who “challenged the patriarchal conventions of traditional Jewish life” (p. 5).

The context of the modern Enlightenment musical and literary salons that met on *jours fixes*, hosted by Jewish women, provided a place of culture (*Bildung*) in which music played an essential place, that promoted a society of virtue (*Tugendbund*), self education, moral improvement, aesthetic refinement, and intellectual discourse. In addition to Levy, *salonnière* hosts included Amalie Beer (mother of Giacomo Meyerbeer), Fanny Mendelssohn Hensel (sister of Felix Mendelssohn), Rahel Varnhagen (1771–1833), Henriette Herz (1764–1847), and Dorothea von Schlegel (1764–1839).

Visited by poets, philosophers, musicians, artists, scientists, and scholars, these salons hosted by Jewish women, who championed religious tolerance, allowed what Immanuel Kant and Moses Mendelssohn called “the pursuit of Enlightenment.” Yet Nancy Sinkoff’s introduction points to Ruth HaCohen’s argument that the libel against the Jews implicit in Western Christian music never allowed this utopian ideal of equality, sympathy, mutuality, and a culture of redemption (Ruth HaCohen, *The Music Libel Against the Jews* [New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2011]).

Sara Levy’s World shows that this secular Enlightenment (*Aufklärung*) worked in tandem with the Haskalah. While Sara Levy’s world emphasized *Bildung* (the German word for culture), Haskalah placed emphasis on *tarbut* (the Hebrew word for culture). The Haskalah leaders known as *maskilim* were dedicated to the modernization of the Talmudic *heder* (elementary and high school) and *yeshivot* (college-level Rabbinic studies) designed to produce *Talmidei Chachamim* (Talmud scholars). This Haskalah trend was towards moderate modernization while at the same time emphasizing knowledge of the Bible (*Tanakh*) and Hebrew grammar (*dikduk*), along with humanistic arts such as modern languages, geography, rhetoric, literature, and so forth. The goals of Haskalah reached their apex in the Wissenschaft des Judentums (Science of Judaism) movement championed by Leopold Zunz, Moritz Steinschneider, and others. As Jeremy Brown has shown in his book *New Heavens and a New Earth: The Jewish Reception of Copernican Thought* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2013), even the knowledge of the sciences in Hebrew translation by *maskilim*, post-Copernicus, was transmitted by Haskalah and Wissenschaft des Judentums scholars. This belief in science and humanities

was shared by the high German cultural world of Sara Levy and the Haskalah movement, although Levy's cultural world embraced modernity, acculturation, and assimilation to a greater degree than the Haskalah movement.

The book is organized in three parts: (1) "Portrait of a Jewish Female Artist: Music, Identity, Image"; (2) "Music, Aesthetics, and Philosophy: Jews and Christians in Sara Levy's World"; and (3) "Studies in Sara Levy's Collection." In chapter 1, Marjanne E. Goozé examines the genesis, high point, and demise of the female-hosted salon in late eighteenth-century Prussia and its role in allowing Jewish women to attain an education in a German secular culture. Chapter 2, by Christoph Wolff, examines the provenance of Sara Levy's collection and the archive of the Sing-Akademie zu Berlin, which is now available online through Bach Digital (<https://www.bach-digital.de> [accessed 24 December 2018]), a project of the Bach Archiv Leipzig. Natalie Naimark-Goldberg's chapter is particularly important for Jewish studies scholars, as it shows that Levy was committed to Jewish causes and institutions, including her support of Haskalah and Jewish education. She demonstrates Levy's successful balance between the German and Jewish worlds. One illustration of this balance was Sara's wedding to Samuel Levy in 1783, for which was commissioned not only a song by Friedemann Bach but also two Hebrew poems, one by Josel Pick, in the tradition of Italian wedding poems.

George Stauffer's chapter, "Women's Voices in Bach's Musical World: Christiane Mariane von Ziegler and Faustina Bordoni," shows that these women played a crucial role in German music history. Ziegler was a poet in Leipzig who wrote texts for nine of Bach's cantatas. Bordoni sang the "Laudamus te" aria from the Mass in B Minor, BWV 232, at the first performance in Dresden in 1733.

Chapter 5, "Lessing and the Limits of Enlightenment," consists of an extract from Martha B. Helfer's full study *The Word Unheard: Legacies of Anti-Semitism in German Literature and Culture* (Evanston, IL: Northwestern University Press, 2011). In addition to Gotthold Ephraim Lessing's well-known play *Nathan der Weise* (1779), Helfer examines his treatise *Die Erziehung des Menschengeschlechts* [The Education of the Human Race] (Berlin: C. F. Voss und Sohn, 1780) and another play, *Die Juden* (1754).

In chapter 6, Elias Sacks looks at Moses Mendelssohn's translation of the psalms and treatment of biblical music. Mendelssohn offered a critique of Christianity by noting that the cantillation or trope in which the Hebrew text is sung is essential to the message and content of the biblical Hebrew. In a letter to Sophie Becker, Mendelssohn wrote that psalms "must be sung with true edification by the most enlightened people [sie von den aufgeklärtesten Menschen mit wahrer Erbauung gesungen werden müssen]" (p. 122). Thus the nature of poetry, music, and harmony render a Jewish appreciation of the sonority of biblical poetry. Sacks argues that while many Christians may possess deep knowledge of the written Torah (the Hebrew bible known as *Torah Shebichtav*), Mendelssohn advocated that Christians also aspire to learn the oral Torah (*Torah Sheba'al Peh*).

Chapter 7 is Yael Sela's essay "Longing for the Sublime: Jewish Self-Consciousness and the *St. Mathew Passion* of Biedermeier Berlin." The Shulchan Arukh, Talmudim, and other rabbinic literature warn against the learning of non-Jewish theologies relegated by some observant Orthodox Jews to "forbidden worship" (known as *avodat kochavim* and *avodah zarah*). Sela shows that the issue of Jewish reception of Lutheran theology and ideology through the music of Bach led members of Sara Levy's circle to be open to

further acculturation and effected their assimilation as traditional religious Jews.

This chapter might have been enhanced by including context for aesthetic study of the sublime from various texts: for example, the first century treatise *Peri Hypsous* [On the Sublime], attributed to Longinus; Immanuel Kant's work *Beobachtungen über das Gefühl des Schönen und Erhabenen* [Observations on the Feeling of the Beautiful and the Sublime] (Königsberg: Kanter, 1764); Edmund Burke's own essay on the subject, *A Philosophical Enquiry into the Origin of Our Ideas of the Sublime and Beautiful* (London: R. and J. Dodsley, 1757); and even discussion of the American Sublime in poetry by Wallace Stevens and others.

Chapter 8 by Rebecca Cypess is the best essay in the collection by showing that the genre of the duet reflects Moses Mendelssohn's concept of "Einheit in der Mannigfaltigkeit" (unity in multiplicity) (p. 182). The aesthetic form of the duet echoes the striving for symbiosis between Jewish and non-Jewish cultures to exist in harmony while preserving their uniqueness. For Mendelssohn, "Einheit in der Mannigfaltigkeit" denoted a relationship of mutual respect among Jews and non-Jews who were able to maintain their individual identities even as they shared a common culture. The form of the duet, in which the instruments play in tandem, enacts an aesthetic ideal of a social and religious sphere in which Jews and non-Jews can mutually recognize and respect each other.

In chapter 9, "The Sociability of Salon Culture and Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach's Quartets," Steven Zohn interprets musical compositions as conversations that express various modes of communication, often on a deeper level than can be achieved through speech. (The book by Robert K. Wallace that compares Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart's music to Jane Austen's novels [*Jane Austen and Mozart: Classical Equilibrium in Fiction and Music* (Athens: University of Georgia Press, 1983)] also applies the analogy of human dialogue likened to musical instruments in harmonious conversation with each other.) Barbara Hahn's appendix, "The *Salonnière* and the Diplomat: Letters from Sara Levy to Karl Gustav von Brinckmann," documents evidence of their interfaith friendship.

A great boon to the book is online access to the recording *In Sara Levy's Salon* (Acis Productions, 2017) by the Raritan Players (<http://www.acisproductions.com/saralevyaudio> [accessed 24 December 2018]), which includes music for solo keyboard collected, commissioned, underwritten, and perhaps played by Levy. This book is highly recommended and will be of great interest to feminist, cultural, and social historians; Jewish studies scholars and musicologists; and more generally to academics, musicians, and educated laymen.

DAVID B. LEVY
Touro College

COMPOSERS AND THEIR WORKS

Allusion as Narrative Premise in Brahms's Instrumental Music. By Jacquelyn E. C. Sholes. (Musical Meaning and Interpretation.) Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2018. [xvi, 256 p. ISBN 9780253033147 (hardcover), \$85; ISBN 9780253033154 (paperback), \$38; ISBN 9780253033161 (e-book), \$36.99.] Music examples, bibliography, index.